

PAGES SSC 2018 Meeting Minutes

22-23 May 2018, Minneapolis, USA

PRESENT

SSC: Willy Tinner (WT), Mike Evans (MNE), Asfawossen Asrat (AA), Pascale Braconnot (PB), Emilie Capron (EC), Ed Brook (EB), Cristiano Chiessi (CC), Peter Gell (PG), Hugues Goosse (HG), Zhimin Jian (ZJ), Darrell Kaufman (DK), Katrin Meissner (KM), Blas Valero-Garcés (BVG).

IPO: Marie-France Loutre, (MFL), Angela Wade (AW)

ABSENT

SSC: Lucien von Gunten (LvG), Lindsey Gillson (LG), Michal Kucera (MK), Yusuke Yokoyama (YY), Future Earth Hannah Moersberger (HM)

1. Introduction and miscellaneous (MNE)

1.1 New to PAGES

MNE thanked BVG for hosting this meeting and to Sheri Fritz for handover from last year. Initial mention of funding and new funding models, and the need for a scientific and funding vision to support these changes. MNE has visited NSF program managers, talked to INQUA US national committee, went to EGU in Spring and saw PAGES contributions, and attended the Future Earth meeting in Montevideo. (This was the first advisory council and governing council meeting and MNE went as a Global Research project (GRP) representative.) Plus MNE is on the national academies panel on climate science with three other US scientists. He knows firsthand how strong and how recognised the work of PAGES is. MNE said if anyone had questioned if what PAGES is doing is valuable, then the answer is a resounding yes and the work of PAGES is needed more than ever. Recognised outside and within community as a valuable resource. MNE is happy to have the wisdom and council of people in the room and invited everyone to introduce themselves for the benefit of the new SSC members EC and ZJ.

1.2 Approval of the Minutes from 2017 SSC meeting and outstanding actions

Decision: Unanimous approval.

1.3 Approval of the 2018 Agenda

Decision: Unanimous approval.

2. IPO News and finances (Marie-France)

2.1 OSM/YSM 2017

Brief recap of expenses from 2018 Open Science Meeting and Young Scientists Meeting in Zaragoza, Spain. Discussion of OSM budget, conference organizer in Bern and Zaragoza. Money PAGES gave just for grants for ECRs etc. MFL said the conference was good value and successful. MNE congratulated BVG and all agreed was a true success.

2.2 Launch of PAGES ECN

Formed after YSM, launched 5 Feb 2017. Attendees organized the network and run it themselves. IPO supports them. Website is well populated, including an ECR people database. Currently calling for WG representatives.

MNE said the ECN will help diversify PAGES. MFL discussed challenges of the group having fast turnover. A representative was invited to this meeting but no one could make it.

Decision: A representative from the ECN should attend future SSC meetings as an observer.

ACTION: Invite a representative asap for 2019 in order for them to have a place at the table as an SSC observer. The rep changes each year and is nominated by the ECN leaders. *(done)*

ACTION: IPO to send email to ECN group leaders to advise of this requirement each year, starting in 2019. This rep would then become the main contact for the year. *(done)*

ACTION: Include the rep in SSC information/emails when appropriate.

Short discussion about working groups and the ECN. Are the WGs doing enough to bring the younger people through?

ACTION: Include a new question in the WG annual report asking for name of ECN representative. *(done)*

ACTION: Include a new question in the ECN annual report regarding collaborations with PAGES WGs. *(done)*

2.3 Funding overview

MFL said budget runs from 1 Jan to 31 Dec, therefore we are already running this budget. US NSF funding to end August. Swiss money lasts until end of December. University of Bern supporting us in kind – very important. Future Earth block grant for 2017 not received. Swedish hub supposed to send. PB discussed Paris hub as possible source of Future Earth grant. MFL sent email to Sweden but no response.

ACTION: MFL to follow up with another email to HM at Future Earth about 2017 funding grant. *(done)*

2.4 Budget overview 2018

Discussion about 2018 budget and correction of total.

Decision: All agree with revised/updated budget and total.

2.5 Budget overview for 2019

Brief discussion as relying on future funding for 2019.

2.6 PAGES future funding

SCNAT: The next Swiss Academy (SCNAT) application (for four years) is due 15 June.

Decision in October. If accepted, funding will start 1 January 2019.

Discussion about the core of the proposal. Circulated (late) a draft of the goals via email before meeting. Parts of proposal still require text. To be discussed further in 15. Any other business.

ACTION: SSC members to provide further feedback by end of first week in June. *(done)*

ACTION: MFL to circulate Googledoc (and email to ZJ) as soon as possible. *(done)*

Brief discussion about SCNAT's expectations of our proposal. National and science based. Switzerland shouldn't be alone in the funding. IPO must stay in Switzerland. Could have smaller office in other countries. SCNAT are flexible about the way the money is used, and it can be used internationally.

2.6.1 Additional funding (See Appendix K)

Discussion about documents in Appendix K.

a. Block contribution: Discussion about possibilities in China, USA, Australia, Future Earth, Belmont Forum, Europe (cost actions).

Decision: WT will be the Australian funding proposal lead.

ACTION: WT to work with KM and Australians on preparing proposal.

ACTION: EB and MNE to follow up with Future Earth Colorado after MNE introduction at Montevideo.

b. Possible other models: Short discussion about membership, adopt a WG.

c. Other activities: Discussion about idea of holding a mini OSM with PAGES WG workshops, bringing PAGES people together more often. Bringing together coordinated working groups.

Decision: 2020 would be the earliest this could be arranged.

ACTION: IPO to write a proposal about proposed joint 2020 SSC meeting and WG meetings.

d. PAGES Magazine as an income revenue option: Discussion about number of printed copies. Could it be reduced? Discussion about possibility of advertising to cover printing costs.

Decision: No decision was made on advertising as a revenue option.

ACTION: AW to include a call for feedback regarding printed magazines in e-news and on front page, to gauge if like hard copies or happy to read online. *(done)*

ACTION: Contact working groups to ask for past sponsors? Look at advertising as an option?

2.6.2 Financial cutbacks

Brief mention of reduction in attendance of meetings by MFL and LvG if no additional funding. Discussion about future SSC Meetings and if some members can pay using own means if possible. Discussed about other funders helping. Discussed online meetings.

3. Review of PAGES Working Groups (Appendix C)

PAGES currently has 21 WGs, in various stages. Some will be sunsetting at the end of the year, while some have just started. After reading the working group annual reports (the only group which didn't submit a report was Forest Dynamics), SSC members discussed the groups which have problems or concerns, and offered suggestions. Time restraints limited discussions to those where problems needed to be addressed.

ACTION: Feedback from all SSC members to be passed on to respective liaisons to include in correspondence with WGs.

(done for GloSS, Floods (which plans to submit an extension proposal in Autumn))

4. Endorsed and affiliated activities

CHN and HistoricalClimatology.com: Active and productive. Happy to keep.

Glacial Ocean Atlas: No connection with leaders. Didn't provide report.

ACTION: IPO to email leaders asking if they want to stay as an affiliated group. *(done, but no response)*

IPICS: EB said going strong. Conference in June.

ICYS: EB spoke with them recently. Original people moved on, new leaders. Active too.

IODP: EB said annual report is generic. Renewal proposal planned for IODP support. He will meet with the Chair of the IODP facilities board to discuss PAGES connections to IODP (Anthony Koppers, an OSU faculty member), most likely in July.

Decision: Keep affiliation. Monitor progress.

PMIP: PB said in 4th phase. Big thing last year was getting all the papers together.

Assimilation to data requests. Hoping for first modeling results in autumn for CMIP6. Also PMIP special issue. Need to arrange next workshop. Wants to find a way to continue dynamics and make sure PMIP well connected for the assimilation.

Decision: Need a new PMIP reporter, because PB is leaving.

ACTION: Choose the new reporter at conclusion of SSC Meeting.

Varves: PG said some members involved in Maine via Aquatic Transitions. Not a lot of contact with them. Discussion about level of activity and continued relevance. Members have good experience.

5. Proposals for new working groups

All members provided feedback on three proposals - from PALSEA, VICS and ClimAfrica.

ACTION: EXCOM members to include SSC member discussions in decision-making process.

6. SSC Nominations

6.1 Current SSC membership

MNE mentioned SSC will miss HG and PB next year.

6.2 Second terms up for renewal

Five are finishing first three-year term and would like to continue: CC, AA, KM, MNE.

ACTION: IPO to email LG to confirm she is happy to continue. (done – happy to continue)

6.3 Nominations for SSC in 2019 (Appendix F)

Applications from six candidates discussed at length. Discussion about how many candidates should be chosen. Discussion about extending the validity of the applications to two years, to keep a pool of nominees.

ACTION: EXCOM members to include SSC member discussions in decision-making process.

ACTION: In 2019 call, advise that applications will be kept for two years.

6.4 Nominations for EXCOM in 2019

ACTION: Follow the same procedure of 2017 in September 2018.

7. Meeting support proposals and SSC comments

Discussed, at length, 10 PAGES working group meeting applications, four Open Call applications and one Educational application.

ACTION: EXCOM members to include SSC member discussions in decision-making process.

8. Where do you see PAGES in five years?

Discussion held over until tomorrow. End of day 1: 18:40

9. Revisited: EXCOM recommendations

WT relayed EXCOM decisions.

New working groups

Decision: WG1 PALSEA extension accepted with comments.

Decision: WG2 VICS extension accepted no comments.

Decision: WG3 ClimAfrica not accepted for now.

Meeting support proposals

Decision: P1 – LandCover6k. Spain 2018. Supported.

Decision: P2 – LandCover6k. India 2019. Supported.

Decision: P3 – C-SIDE. Canada 2018. Supported.

Decision: P4 – Extremes IA. Germany 2019. Supported.

Decision: P5 – CVAS. USA 2018. Supported.
Decision: P6 – DAPS. US or China 2019. Supported.
Decision: P7 – CRIAS. Switzerland 2018. Supported.
Decision: P8 – VICS. UK 2019. Supported.
Decision: P9 – PALEOLINK. Spain 2019. Supported.
Decision: P10 – CLIVASH2k. UK 2018. Supported.
Decision: O1 – ICP. Australia 2019. Supported.
Decision: O2 – PaleoENSO. Indonesia 2019. Supported.
Decision: O3 – Climovar. Spain 2019. Supported.
Decision: O4 – Paleo in Patagonia. Chile 2018. Not supported.
Decision: E1 – Summer School on Speleothems. Romania 2019. Supported.
ACTION: IPO to send notification emails by mid-June and include SSC liaisons. (done)

SSC members for 2019

Decision: Paul Valdes and Boris Vannièrè invited to join SSC from January 2019.
ACTION: MFL to send names to Future Earth for approval. (done)

Working group liaisons

Decision: PALSEA – EC
Decision: VICS – MNE
Decision: PMIP – Paul Valdes
Decision: Global Paleofire - EB

10. Integrative Activities (IAs) (Appendix J)

10.1 Data stewardship (DK)

- a. DK mentioned background information in Appendix J. The DS IA is not aiming for a product based on a research question. Real need for PAGES/data compilations, setting and developing best practices for accessibility of data. There is no working group dedicated to this IA.
- b. Past Global Changes Magazine on this topic end 2018. See section 12.2.
- c. LvG championing a memorandum of understanding between PAGES and NOAA and Neotoma. To formalise and highlight common interest and ways to collaborate together.
- d. The technical note published in *Climate of the Past*, and written by co-editors of special issue, described the significant step of requiring (rather than recommending) all 15 papers to have data publicly accessible. The technical note we wrote filled an important gap in developing data policies by hearing from scientists who generate and use data on how to implement policies that are only generally described by publishers. The same procedure is now also being used in the YSM special issue. ECR co-eds are working through same procedure. DK believes this is an opportunity to find funding to help WGs secure data. He encouraged all interested SSC members to pursue funding in their countries to support PAGES efforts to make paleo data publicly accessible. Can feed you everything he has. This resonates with funders.
- e. Discussion about risks of data being scooped and need for embargo. Further work to be done such as survey, discussion. DK suggested that the IA focus on reducing the loss of valuable paleo data from future re-use, the importance of the publication step to accomplish this, and the easy solutions to minor issues such as embargoes.
- f. ICSU WDS: Suggestion to become partner.

ACTION: IPO and DK to contact ICSU WDS showing PAGES interest and prepare MoU.

g. NOAA agreement: Document currently being worked on and progressing well. With Neotoma it was just a letter saying we are supporting them and they are happy to collaborate. This is more in depth.

h. Maybe potential agreements with others?

ACTION: LvG to explore possibilities to have additional agreements with other data repositories.

10.2 The Earth system in a warmer world (Warmer Worlds) (KM)

a. KM discussed the process of writing WW paper: workshop in Bern May 2017 putting together the subgroup contributions in September 2017. Submission and paper in press 25 June 2018 with *Nature Geoscience*.

b. Future of this activity? Either discontinue for now or identify new topic such as “World under high CO₂ concentration.”

Decision: Close this IA as goals have been achieved.

ACTION: Create new Former IAs and remove from website main page and scientific triangle.

10.3 Extreme events and risk management (HG and BVG)

a. GH and BVG reported on past activities and the EGU splinter meeting.

b. A workshop will be organized in 2019.

ACTION: KM to think about names for HG to contact for new Extremes Center in Australia. (done)

ACTION: SSC members to identify participants from different working groups who can be involved in this IA. Send names to HG.

10.4 Thresholds, tipping points and multiple equilibria in the Earth system (EB)

a. EB discussed splinter meeting at EGU 2018. 51 attended. Strong community interest from many different fields. Collaboration with AIMES group (another Future Earth GRP which was previously called GAIM under IGBP).

b. Next step to Skype with AIMES to see synergy between groups. Workshop probably next step after that, but need better definitions of questions. *(done, actively considering workshop)*

c. Challenges: How to get financial support outside PAGES? One option could be RCN in USA. How to position amongst the many groups dealing with the topic? Identifying the question and precise topic?

d. Brief mention that Thresholds IA could be the focal point for an important paper and to draw on expertise from WGs. Definitions need to be sorted out, plus question of timescale.

ACTION: SSC members to identify participants from different working groups who can be involved in this IA. Send names to EB.

ACTION: EB to ask inner circle for additional names.

10.5 Potential new Integrative Activities (new item)

a. Climate impact on human activities/societies, using VICS, Forests. Produce a summary paper.

b. Humans and climate of the past. Crisis in humans.

c. IA overarching LandCover6k, GloSS, Aquatic Transitions.

d. IA with 2k and Floods.

e. All should be focused and specific.

ACTION: PG to report back to PEOPLE 3000 and mention new IA options.

ACTION: PG to contact IHOPE to see if they would be keen on collaborating on potential IA.

11. Upcoming meetings (Appendix L)

11.1 PAGES SSC Meeting 2019

Discussion about locations and dates. China, Ethiopia, other potentials?

Decision: PAGES next SSC Meeting will be held in Addis Ababa sometime during the last two weeks of March 2019. A symposium will be held in conjunction. AA to organise.

ACTION: IPO to send poll to find best dates. SSC to respond asap. *(done)*

ACTION: IPO to be in contact with AA for details/planning.

11.2 Next OSM and YSM

Discussion about OSM in China.

Discussions about WG meetings at OSM.

Discussion of balance between plenaries, parallel sessions and posters.

Decision: Keep the model of equal thirds as before.

Discussed the procedure for call for expressions of interest (EoI).

Decision: Keep the same procedure as before. First a call for EoI and then make shortlist.

ACTION: MFL to send call for EoI in early 2019.

ACTION: In EoI, ask how applicant can accommodate extra WG meetings.

ACTION: In EoI, explain YSM should be in a more remote location than the OSM, like a retreat, to keep attendees together.

ACTION: Rethink filming all talks - was expensive. Maybe just plenaries. Streaming instead?

11.3 AGU, EGU and other general assemblies

AGU: December 2018. Washington. MFL, LvG, EB to attend. DK in Switzerland.

EGU: April 2019. No comments.

JpGU: YY presenting PAGES there now.

ICP 2019: Plans underway for working groups to have side meetings as well.

EAA: Same time in Bern as ICP.

Decision: Liaisons to please consider attending WG meetings and some of these external meetings to ease the load for MFL and LvG.

Workshops

a. Morocco: Rachid Cheddadi holding "Past Plant Diversity Changes" in Rabat in October.

b. Romania: Marcel Mindrescu has asked for the same thing – PAGES support but not financial for his Carpathian workshop.

Decision: Create a new "PAGES-endorsed" workshop option on calendar. No logo and no financial assistance, but mention in text of endorsed.

ACTION: Discuss about creating endorsed group for Carpathian project with Marcel Mindrescu when he visits.

c. iSLR18 – INQUA PAGES workshop for ECRs. Organised by young scientists. End of August 2018.

12. PAGES Products and Communication

12.1 IPCC AR6

MFL compiled a document for lead authors and coordinating lead authors of AR6 Working Groups 1 and 2. They have the state of the art at time when sent. Wants to send update.

MFL discussed possible “reviewathon” in Bern for SROCC. If this test works, could be done for AR6 WG1 and 2. Don’t know if will lead to something or not.

ACTION: PB to advise MFL when she has to produce and send the update. (done)

ACTION: MFL to collect and send update when appropriate.

12.2 Magazine

a. LandCover6k Magazine will be released in June. Big issue.

b. Following one is on Data (end of 2018). Building and harnessing open paleo data. Jack Williams Neotoma prime editor, Alicia Newton, LvG and DK. 20 pieces committed, many featuring the scientific incentive to pull together data to answer scientific questions and the tools needed to analyse data sets.

c. Need a topic for first magazine of 2019. Group discussion of potential topics. Extremes? Historical or archaeological perspective? Are any of the other groups evolved enough to take on an issue? Ecological simulations? Dynamic simulations? Sea level (related to PALSEA QSR issue)? Social sciences?

ACTION: LvG to send call to WGs and ECN asap. (done)

12.3 Communications

AW presented update of 2017-2018 Communications output and strategy.

Discussed increase in subscriber numbers, social media interactions etc.

13. WCRP update (Appendix I)

MFL described JSC meeting in China last month, plus the need to renew scientific partnership with WCRP. Discussed the Future Earth, WCRP and ICSU joint KAN on Extremes. PB discussed CLIVAR, WCRP and Future Earth connections.

Decision: SSC agreed WCRP partnership is important.

ACTION: Scientific agreement. MFL to approach new Exec Director in September.

MFL discussed strong and light connections between WCRP Grand Challenges (Extremes), themes (PMIP) and projects. PB suggested PAGES should do something with CliC project, because no paleo in their plans. Stronger links could be interesting. Short discussion about SCAR and possible connection.

ACTION: IPO to send email to PALSEA and C-SIDE to look into CliC. Create a connection? Also Southern Ocean in CLIVAR and SCAR. (done)

14. Future Earth update (Appendix H)

MNE spoke about the governing council and advisory committee meeting in Montevideo. GLP’s Ricardo Grau (Argentina) and MNE represented all the Future Earth GRPs. All hub leaders were there and spoke to GRP reps specifically. From letter Amy wrote afterwards, we were heard. Going to help us find money. Organizing meeting of all GRPs and KANs in Bonn 28-29 August.

Decision: HG, LvG and MFL to represent PAGES in Bonn.

ACTION: MFL to send email to Future Earth and tell MFL, HG and LvG will attend. (done)

HG discussed upcoming meeting in Paris, 28 June. Has had past contact with KANs but nothing eventuated. MNE discussed idea of IA swallowing a KAN. MFL discussed Swiss committee (four GRPs) and monthly meetings.

14.3.a Ocean KAN.

MFL received email from Anna Zivian – development team has been created. In process of running several working groups and projects underway including collaboration with different GRPs. They would be happy for us to be involved as well.

ACTION: MFL to ask specifically how PAGES can contribute.

14.3.b Natural Assets KAN.

MFL mentioned she is part of the development team but she is not included in emails. Unsure how PAGES can fit. Bern meeting provided nothing concrete.

Decision: Try to find new/stronger connections at meeting in Bonn in August.

15. Any other business

15.1 New Item: First draft of SCNAT document

ZJ said will encourage high-ranking Chinese officials to come to Switzerland.

Members discussed, at length, what should be included in the SCNAT report due 15 June.

Potential Australian funding revisited with discussion on eligible budget items.

WT mentioned PAGES' Wikipedia page which was deleted by Wikipedia officials in 2017.

ACTION: AW to arrange for Wikipedia to be activated again.

15.2 Where do you see PAGES in 5 years?

SSC members discussed plans for the future.

Topics included IPCC contributions, going back even further into the past, specific potential working groups, the Anthropocene, strengthening marine connections/aspects, Holocene climate variability, bioclimatic models, composition of countries, Future Earth and KANs, taking data stewardship further as a possible source of income, magazine being peer reviewed, INQUA, national or regional membership, ECR workshop every two years, the international component/contribution to PAGES that not financially accounted for, making more of a noise about the impact of our papers, questions in the working group annual reports.

ACTION: Update annual report forms. Just one year for meetings and lifetime for products.

Discussed SSC meeting program and EXCOM meeting going late into the night.

Decision: Finish Day 1 of SSC Meeting at 16:00, so EXCOM can meet earlier.

ACTION: For November EXCOM meeting, create a template for responses for working group proposals and workshop applications to streamline discussions.